



**Network of Regional Governments  
for Sustainable Development**

*Doc AGM. Québec Minutes Page 1 of 7*

## **General Assembly Meeting – Minutes**

31 August 2011, City of Québec, Québec

### **Participants**

#### **Co-chairs**

Catalonia	Lluís Recoder i Miralles - Minister for Territory and Sustainability Marta Subirá i Roca - Director General for Environmental Policies Susanna Rivero Baughman - Foreign Affairs and Cooperation Advisor
São Paulo	Bruno Covas - Secretary of State for the Environment Nelson Bugayo – Vice President of CETESB Ana Paula Fava – International Advisor, Environment State Secretariat

#### **Vice-Presidents**

Brittany <i>VP Europe</i>	Jean-Yves Le Drian, President of the Regional Council Dominique Ramard, President of the Environment-Energy Commission of the Regional Council Renaud Layadi, Advisor for International Networks, Regional Council of Brittany
ANAAE (Mexico) <i>VP Latin America and Caribbean Treasury- CPMR</i>	Silvia Whizar Lugo, Coordinator General of ANAAE and Secretary of State for Natural Resources and Environmental Protection of Tabasco José Luis Funes Izaguirre, International Liaison Officer for ANAAE Damien Périssé, Director for Innovation and Competitiveness
<i>Secretariat</i>	Maruxa Cardama, Secretary General Lucy Mathieson, Policy and Advocacy Officer (Trainee)
<i>External Expert</i>	Hugo Séguin, Lecturer at Sherbrooke University, Research Associate at the Centre of International Studies of Montreal (CEIM) and Principal Advisor in Équiterre

#### **Other members**

Aquitaine	Béatrice Gendreau, Regional Councillor for Forests and Organic Farming Olivier Degos, Regional Delegate for Sustainable Development Nolwenn Le Tallec, European Officer, Aquitaine Office in Brussels
Basque Country	Marta Marín, Delegate of the Government to the EU Enrique Urrutia Director of Institutional Relations and Innovation, Basque Water Agency
Buenos Aires	Carlos Alberto Olivera, Executive Coordinator of Environmental Inspection Norma Mónica Casanovas, Advisor on climate change
Callao	Manuel Antonio Burga Samame, Executive Director of Environmental Health Gioconda Rosalba Tripi Morales, Head of International Cooperation Carlos Alberto Quiroz Giraldo, Executive Coordinator of the Environment Julio Félix Echazu Peralta, Regional Manager of Natural Resources and Environmental Management
CONAGO	José Luis Benitez Gil, Coordinator of CONAGO and Vice Secretary of State for the Environment and Natural Resources
Fatick	Coumba Ndoffène Bouna Diouf, President of the Regional Council Alassane Ndour, Secretary General of the Regional Council
Goiás	Denise Daleva Costa, Coordinator of the Unit for Special Projects Leonardo Moura Vilela, Secretary of State for the Environment and Water Management



**Network of Regional Governments  
for Sustainable Development**

*Doc AGM. Québec Minutes Page 2 of 7*

Mbale	Andrew Mawejje, Chief Administrative Officer, District Local Council
North Burkina	Aboubacar Réliwendé Savadogo, President of the Regional Council
OLAGI	Maria Pilar Vela Murgueityo, Executive Secretary
ORU-FOGAR	Michel Vauzelle, President Maria Adelaida Muñoz, Secretary
PACA	Michel Vauzelle, President of the Regional Council Gérard Bodinier, Advisor to the President Philippe Cichowlaz, Director General of International Relations and European Affairs Caroline Muller, Project Manager, International Relations Eleftheria Kasoura, Project Manager, European and International Cooperation
Parana	Mariese Muchailh, Coordinator of Biodiversity and Flora Themis Piazzetta Marques, Forest Engineer
Québec	Charles La Rochelle, Deputy Vice Minister for Climate Change, MDDEP Vincent Royer, Climate Change Coordinator, MRI Michele Fournier, Climate Change Bureau Senior Advisor, MDDEP Claude Audet-Robitaille, International Affairs Advisor, MRI Claude Côté, Climate Change Bureau Advisor, MDDEP Marc Deblois, Advisor, MDDEP
Rhône Alpes	Amélie Jalla, Project Officer for Biodiversity, Regional Council Hélène Loiseau, Policy Officer, Delegation of Rhône Alpes to the EU
Wales	John Griffiths, Minister for the Environment and Sustainable Development Jon Townley, Head of International Sustainable Development and the Wales for Africa Team Elin Rowlands, Private Secretary to Minister Griffiths
Wallonie	Annick Fourmeaux, President of the Air and Climate Agency Jean-Marie Wauthier, Director of the Environment Portfolio, Wallonie-Bruxelles-International

A list of all guests and observers who attended the open session can be [here](#) in the final delegate list.

***Apologies received***

Aragón	Vote delegated to Catalonia
Canarias, Spain	Last minute apology due to cancellation of flight (Storm 'Irene')
Cantabria, Spain	
Flanders	
North Sumatra VP Asia	
The Northern Forum	
Santa Fe, Argentina	



**Network of Regional Governments  
for Sustainable Development**

Agenda	Comments - Action points
<p><b>Open session</b></p> <p><b>- Welcome and apologies</b>  <b>- The agenda is approved</b> – the intervention of PACA in its capacity of Presidency of ORU-FOGAR is brought FOGAR in order to accommodate for travelling constraints</p> <p><b>Application for membership – The</b> applications for membership of Buenos Aires (Argentina), Hauts Bassins (Burkina Faso), Rhône-Alpes (France) and Paraná (Brazil) are ratified</p> <p><b>nrg4SD on the Eve of its 10<sup>th</sup> Anniversary: Future Outlook</b> – Brittany presented the outlook of nrg4SD on the 10<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the network and announced the Convention between CDC Climat and nrg4SD. ANNAE followed with its presentation. Both Vice Presidencies called for building upon the success stories accumulated by the network so far in order to go one step beyond in its development</p> <p>Members welcome the Convention with CDC Climat as an essential support to the nrg4SD Financing Climate Action Working Group.</p> <p><b>Networking between networks: Synergies with ORU-FOGAR – PACA</b>, in its capacity of President of ORU-FOGAR presented proposals for strengthening the collaboration between nrg4SD and ORU-FOGAR on the basis of the complementary mission of both networks. It is agreed to refine the intervention and partnership logics: (i) Analyse requests as closely as possible to ensure that they are in line with the network’s political ambitions and (ii) carefully assess the partnerships to be developed with other networks or organisations to ensure their operational interest and their convergence with a strategic approach.</p> <p>It is agreed to deepen the collaboration and economies of scale with ORU-FOGAR and to pursue the joint work towards the World Water Forum in 2012.</p> <p>It is recommended to explore win-win scenarios for collaboration with ICLEI for UNFCCC COP17 Durban and the Rio +20 Conference</p> <p><b>Deliberations and adoption of the Declaration of Québec and the thematic resolutions for future work</b> - The Secretariat took members through the contents of the draft Declaration and the Resolutions. Members accepted the amendment to the draft Declaration referring to 2011 International Year for Forests put forward by Aquitaine in its capacity of Coordinator of the Forests Working Group after the approval of the draft Declaration by the Steering Committee. The General Assembly adopted the Declaration of Québec and the Resolutions. The Declaration of Québec was signed by nrg4SD members at the end of the open session of the General Assembly meeting.</p> <p align="center"><b>Closed session – nrg4SD members only</b></p> <p><b>Presentation of work programme developments</b> on the basis of the zero edition of the nrg4SD Newsletter. Ms Maruxa Cardama, Secretary General of nrg4SD explained the objectives and structures of the new nrg4SD Newsletter to members and took them through the main developments of the network’s activity under all</p>	<p>It is agreed to ratify the applications for membership from Buenos Aires, Hauts Bassins, Rhône-Alpes and Paraná</p> <p>The Vice-Presidencies call on building upon the successes so far in order to go one step beyond in the development of the network</p> <p>Members welcome the Convention with CDC Climat</p> <p>It is agreed to: (i) refine the assessment of partnership request project in order to ensure an alignment with the network’s objectives; (ii) deepen the collaboration with ORU-FOGAR and pursue the joint work towards the World Water Forum 2012; (iii) explore win-win scenarios for collaboration with ICLEI for UNFCCC and Rio +20</p> <p>Declaration of Québec and thematic resolutions adopted</p> <p>Members are encouraged to use the Newsletter as a dissemination tool and a space for matching project ideas. They are also encouraged to</p>



Network of Regional Governments  
for Sustainable Development

Doc AGM, Québec Minutes Page 4 of 7

thematic areas. Members are encouraged to use the Newsletter as a dissemination tool and a space for matching project ideas. They are also encouraged to contribute with ideas for a name for the Newsletter. The only proposal so far (put forward by the Secretariat) is 'Sustainable Times'.

- **Governance aspects** – items for adopted by the Steering Committee for ratification by the General Assembly

**Information about the state of collaboration between Aragon and Catalonia for the co-chair for the North** - Catalonia to exercise full co-chairmanship for the North from now until the end of the ongoing 3-year mandate 2010-2013 (end of the joint co-chairmanship with Aragon). The shared co-chairmanship by Aragon and Catalonia had been envisaged as a temporary mechanism to allow for mutual support, given the election calendar in late 2010 for Catalonia and in early 2011 for Aragon.

**Reelection of Sao Paulo as Co-chair for the South** - São Paulo reiterates its commitment with nrg4SD following from the elections in late 2010, as well as its keen interest in being considered for reelection as Co-Chair for South. This scenario is considered as particularly beneficial for the Network given that 2012 will have a distinctive Brazilian and 'Southern' character in the area of sustainable development, due to the Rio +20 Conference taking place in June 2012. São Paulo was re-elected as Co-Chair for the South

**Information about the end of the mandate of the current Treasury – a call for candidatures shall remain open as of this moment** – The Conference of Peripheral Maritime Regions CPMR, will step down as Treasury on 31.12.2011 when its mandate ends. It is agreed that the general rule for the nomination of Treasury should remain volunteer candidatures and a call for candidatures is to remain open amongst Steering Committee members for the next 2 months - until 1 November 2011. This timing is scheduled in order to allow for a smooth hand-over from the CPMR before the end of the year. The Secretariat shall put forward proposals for the election of a Treasury in the cases where voluntary candidatures will not be possible. So far Aquitaine, Mbale and Wallonia have made preliminary expressions of interest.

**Reform of nrg4SD Statutes and announcement of future work on the elaboration of standing rules in development of the new Statutes** - New Statutes were adopted, substantially based on the proposal made by the Secretariat and following amendments from the Steering Committee. The Secretariat read to members a concise summary of the main elements under the proposals for new Statutes, highlighting the amendments introduced by the Steering Committee. Steering Committee discussions are outlined in the minutes of the Steering Committee meeting of 29 August 2009.

- **Strategic and budgetary aspects** – items for deliberation and adoption by the General Assembly, following recommendations by the Steering Committee

**Functioning of the Permanent Secretariat –**

**Renewal of the contract of the Secretary General** - The process for selecting a Secretary General was launched in April 2010, following the decision of the Steering Committee and the adoption by the General Assembly. The current Secretary General Ms. Maruxa Cardama came into office on 01.09.2010, under a 1 year Belgian employment contract subject to Belgian tax, that comes to an end on 31.08.2011 – i.e. the last day of the General Assembly meeting. It agreed to renew the contract of Ms. Maruxa Cardama as Secretary General on the basis of the

contribute with ideas for a name for the Newsletter. The only proposal so far (put forward by the Secretariat) is 'Sustainable Times'.

Catalonia to exercise full co-chairmanship for the North until the end of the 3-year ongoing mandate 2010-2013

It is agreed to ratify the candidature of São Paulo for reelection as Co-Chair for the South

CPMR to step down as Treasury on 31.12.2011

It is agreed that volunteer candidacies shall remain the general rule for the nomination of Treasury

A call for candidatures for Treasury is to remain open amongst Steering Committee members for the next 2 months – until 1 November 2011

So far, Aquitaine, Mbale and Wallonia have made preliminary expressions of interest

New Statutes were adopted, substantially based on the proposal made by the Secretariat and following amendments from the Steering Committee at its meeting of 29 August 2009.

Agreement to renew the contract of Ms Maruxa Cardama as nrg4SD Secretary General

Commitment from Catalonia to employ the Secretary General with a Spanish law contract on behalf of nrg4SD and under the network's



Network of Regional Governments  
for Sustainable Development

Doc AGM, Québec Minutes Page 5 of 7

highly-performing services provided in development of her job description. Catalonia reiterates its commitment to employ Maruxa Cardama with a Spanish law contract - on behalf of nrg4SD, under the network's budget and for the length of the co-chair mandate of Catalonia. It is found that this should allow the network to make substantial savings. Wallonia enquired on the amount of savings to be made. Catalonia and the Secretariat pointed out that the exact figure was not available yet, as Catalonian legal services were still working on the dossier. As a matter of example, it was pointed out that the net salary of the Secretary General was less than 50% of the total costs for the network.

*Establishment of a small team* - Agreement to establish a small team as an essential condition to consolidate the achievements of the network so far and improve services to members - Special attention should be given to the situation of Ms. Lucy Mathieson, who is currently providing full-time high-quality services to nrg4SD without a contract - The Basque Country will hire an Erasmus Entrepreneur on behalf of nrg4SD and top up the allowance provided by the EU

**Mid term review of nrg4SD Strategy 2008-2014 and benchmarking exercise - presentation of the analysis for the nrg4SD Secretariat by international expert Hugo Séguin, on the basis of the documents circulated prior to the meeting.** The Mid term review provides an evaluation of the goals, strategies and tools suggested in the 2008-2014 Strategy; it highlights a number of relevant international trends and it appraises recent achievements of the network. It finally makes a series of recommendations designed to serve as the founding blocks of an updated, 2012-2018 Strategy. The analysis finds that some of the main objectives set out in the Strategy are quickly being reached. The network is achieving results, developing content and adding value both for its members and to the global agenda. As foreseen, the Content Strategy has also led to increased international recognition for both nrg4SD and subnational governments, as a constituency growing in relevance and influence. It also finds that, given current level of resources, the network is risking overextension and over commitment. The current pace of development clearly appears unsustainable. The network - and most particularly its Secretariat - is now fully engaged on at least three major processes within the global sustainable agenda (Biodiversity, Climate Change and Rio+20). It is also facing growing expectations from key partners, including many UN bodies.

The Benchmarking exercise seeks to compare, on the basis of quantitative indicators, a range of international organisations whose objective is similar to that of nrg4SD. It summarises their respective objectives, examines the resources available to them and provides a comparison ranking between them. It presents some general findings and finally proposes a set of recommendations. According to this Benchmarking Exercise, in general, given its objective and its ambitions, it is very clear that nrg4SD has the lowest level of resources among the other international organisations analysed in this document. Moreover, the recent successes of the network, particularly in terms of achieving international recognition, lead to a level of expectation which is incompatible with the current level of resources available to the network.

*Fact 1* - A network with high ambitions has fewer resources than others - From all the organisations listed, nrg4SD has the lowest score in terms of resources available. Its annual budget of 180,000 euros compares unfavourably with that of organisations with a similar mandate, such as the Northern Forum (904.000 euros) and CPMR (more than 3 million euros), or with other organisations working with UN bodies to promote and defend the interests of their members, such as CAN-I (853.000 euros), or ICLEI (with more than 11 million euros). This disproportion is also reflected in the level of permanent staff available. With 1 permanent employee (Secretary General) and occasional trainees, nrg4SD cannot compete with other major international networks such as CAN-I (6 permanent, plus 3 part-time), OLAGI (5 permanent) the Northern Forum (4-6), much less than CPMR (20), WBCSD (40

budget, in order to make savings for the budget of the network

Agreement to establish a small team as an essential condition to consolidate the strategic positioning achieved so far and to improve services to members - Special attention should be given to the situation of Ms. Lucy Mathieson, who is currently providing full-time high-quality services to nrg4SD without a contract - The Basque Country will hire an Erasmus Entrepreneur on behalf of nrg4SD and top up the allowance provided by the EU

It is agreed that:

- the 2008-2014 Strategy to be updated will focus on the 1) Consolidation of existing commitments; 2) Increase of available resources and 3) Deepening of the involvement within key UN processes
- climate change, biodiversity and Rio +20- the level of resources available to the network be greatly expanded
- a regular evaluation process by members be established
- the largest possible support from current members be achieved
- new key members should be invited to join, especially federated states and regions from North America and the Global South
- the use of institutional or private contributions should be explored
- a communication plan for the network be developed



Network of Regional Governments  
for Sustainable Development

Doc AGM. Québec Minutes Page 6 of 7

+) and ICLEI (200). This finding is even more problematic as the governance structure and mission of nrg4SD are in large part, similar to those of the other organisations surveyed.

*Fact 2 - Limited membership base -* Although it is difficult to compare the solidity of the foundation of organisations solely on the basis of their membership, the membership of nrg4SD (46 member governments) appears more limited than that of other organisations, with the exception of the Northern Forum (12 member regions), which however, provides resources 4 to 6 times higher than that of nrg4SD. European-based organisations, such as ENCORE (111 members) or CPMR (160 members), and older, more institutionalised ones, already enjoy a much larger membership. Despite the existence of different political and institutional realities in many parts of the world, we can also see that nrg4SD is far from reaching the full potential of its membership. This membership base is inevitably reflected in the level of resources available from the annual membership fees. A broad membership base is likely to generate additional resources.

*Fact 3 – Funding sources not yet explored -* The analysis also shows that many of the organisations surveyed are diversifying their sources of funding beyond single membership fees, by appealing to private or institutional donors. nrg4SD only relies on contributions (cash and in kind) of its most involved members and does not seem to have developed an objective to look for complementary funding.

**2011 Financial Report and 2012 Budget proposal –** Presentation by the Treasurer on the basis of the documents circulated prior to the meeting. The Treasurer presented in detail the execution of the 2010 budget and the project budget for 2011. The Treasurer explained the new structure of budgetary lines for the 2011 budget as a consequence of the establishment of a permanent Secretariat and outlined key proposed budgetary lines for 2011.

The Treasurer stressed the dangerous risk of high deficit that nrg4SD is facing and proposed an increase in all annual membership fees of 50% compared to 2010 fees. It was highlighted that the current reserve fund is facing exhaustion by 2012 if no budgetary balance is found. The Treasurer explained that a 50% increase in all membership fees would allow for budgetary balance, while a substantial enlargement of membership constitutes a serious medium and long-term option.

Wallonia requested to note for the record that fees applying to members from developed countries have been increased recently and that, in a constructive spirit, it would not oppose a decision to increase fees provided this would not become a habit.

It was agreed to increase all membership fees in 50%, with the support of Flanders and The Northern Forum relayed to the Secretariat prior to the meeting. All members agreed on the crucial need to work intensively on enlarging the membership base and on exploring additional funding opportunities.

It is recommended to include in the Standing Rules that the network shall keep a minimum of 60,000 € for the reserve fund, below which it would not be authorised to fall.

**Recommendations of the European meeting in preparation of the General Assembly –** by Brittany in its capacity of nrg4SD Vice Chair for Europe on the basis of the minutes of the European meeting circulated prior to the meeting. It is agreed

- to believe in ourselves and in our capacity to act both in partnership with each other and with European and international bodies;
- that nrg4SD can only promote the regional and federated State levels if the network's resources match the political project and not the other way round;
- that nrg4SD also become a platform where political dialogue is organised so that

It is agreed that all membership fees shall be increased by 50% in 2012, compared to 2011 annual fees. All members agreed on the crucial need to work intensively on enlarging the membership base and on exploring additional funding opportunities.

It is agreed to include in the Standing Rules that the network shall keep a minimum of 60,000 € for the reserve fund

It is agreed (i) to believe in ourselves and in our capacity to act both in partnership with each other and with European and international bodies; (ii) that nrg4SD can only promote the regional and federated State levels if the network's resources match the political project; (iii) that nrg4SD also



Network of Regional Governments  
for Sustainable Development

*Doc AGM. Québec Minutes Page 7 of 7*

members' point of view can be represented with more strength and consistency;  
- that this General Assembly enable nrg4SD to decide on its future, in particular enable us to build the nrg4SD's finances sustainably and set us on the path for the network's 10th anniversary which will be celebrated in parallel to the Rio+20 Conference;  
- to set an objective to increase income by means of fees around €60,000 to €80,000 from the recruitment of new regions in the horizon of June 2014;  
- to better use the "service" which the nrg4SD Secretariat can provide, by being more active in the working groups and creating better links between the technical development of our objectives and their political representation;  
- to follow the Benchmarking of comparable networks that has been elaborated for the Secretariat

**Date of the next Steering Committee:** - Following from discussions and proposals put forward after the Steering Committee it is agreed that:

The next Steering Committee will take place in February 2012 around the dates relevant for Rio +20 work.

The next General Assembly shall take place in São Paulo immediately before or around the dates of the Preparatory Commission for Rio +20 of late May 2012.

A special event (in line with a World Summit of Regions) to be organised in Rio de Janeiro, with the support of the State of Rio, around the dates of the Rio +20 Conference.

Members greatly appreciated the invitations from São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro.

become a platform where political dialogue is organised with more strength and consistency; (iv) that this General Assembly enable nrg4SD to decide on its future, in particular enable us to build the nrg4SD's finances sustainably; (v) to set an objective to increase income by means of fees around €60,000 to €80,000 from the recruitment of new regions in the horizon of June 2014; (vi) to better use the "service" which the nrg4SD Secretariat can provide being more active in the working groups and creating better links between the technical and the political objectives; (vi) to follow the Benchmarking of comparable networks that has been elaborated for the Secretariat

Next Steering Committee in February 2012 around the dates relevant to Rio +20 – Next General Assembly in São Paulo before or around the dates of the Rio +20 Preparatory Committee of late May 2012 – A special event to be organised in Rio de Janeiro around the dates of the Rio +20 Conference